Racial Equity & Postsecondary Attainment: An Analysis of the States

Wil Del Pilar  Vice President of Higher Education Policy and Practice  
@Wil_EdTrust

J. Oliver Schak  Senior Research Analyst for Higher Education  
@SchakJ
Session Overview

• About Ed Trust
• The State Equity Report Card (teaser)
• State ratings on degree attainment among Black and Latino adults
• Racial equity analysis of state attainment goals
• Best practices for centering racial equity in attainment goals
State Equity Report Card
Background

• The State Equity Report Card (SERC)
  • Grading/rating system that communicates states’ commitment to equitable college opportunity and success for people of color and individuals from low-income backgrounds

• The SERC project includes a data tool, several reports, and other collateral that focus on:
  • Degree Attainment (2018)
  • Undergraduate Enrollment Representation (February/March 2019)
  • Undergraduate Degree Earner Representation (February/March 2019)
  • College Affordability (Spring 2019)
Goals and Audience

• Put pressure on state policymakers and leaders in Higher Ed to improve opportunity and success for Black and Latino students

• Produce state-level data that can be used by advocates and state policymakers

• Provide advocates and policymakers with equity benchmarks that indicate what equity looks like
The State Equity Report Card

The State Equity Report Card assesses states' commitment to equitable college opportunity and success for Black and Latino Americans. This tool contains state-level data on who has a college degree, who enrolls in college, and who graduates.

Ready to Get Started?

FIND MY STATE  COMPARE STATES
State Equity Report Card: State Page
State Equity Report Card: Compare States

Degree Attainment

Select an option to update the data displayed in the maps and charts below.

Show me... Degree Attainment Level for... Black Americans and... Sort by...

Degree Attainment Level

Which states have the highest and lowest percentage of Black adults who have earned a college degree?

LA 21%
AR 22%
WI 24%
WV 24%
MS 24%
NV 25%
SC 25%
KY 25%
MI 26%
AL 26%
State Ratings on Degree Attainment Among Black and Latino Adults
What is Degree Attainment?

The share of adults, ages 25 to 64, that have some sort of college degree

Degree attainment is not a college graduation rate

Degree attainment looks at education level at a singular point in time
Why Focus on Attainment and Racial Equity?

Over 40 states with degree attainment goals

Achieving these goals will be unlikely without closing gaps in degree attainment

From 2000 to 2016

- Number of Latino adults grew 72%
- Number of Black adults grew 25%
- Number of White adults remained flat

47% of jobs will require a postsecondary degree (77 million jobs)

A college degree provides both individual and social benefits
Degree Attainment Framework

Three Metrics

- Overall Degree Attainment
- Growth in Degree Attainment since 2000
- Gap in Degree Attainment

Data Sources

- National Data - 2016 American Community Survey
- State Data – 3yr Average of 2014-2016 American Community Surveys
- 2000 Decennial Census was used as the baseline to measure growth in attainment for both national and state calculations
What Affects Degree Attainment?

- How well colleges and universities have historically (and currently) enrolled and graduated Black and Latino students
- State workforce/economy and migration between states
- Demographics of residents (e.g., age, immigration status)
31% of Black Adults and 47% of White Adults Have a College Degree or Higher

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau's 2016 American Community Survey.
Attainment Gaps are Largest Among Young Black and White Adults
FIGURE 4 DEGREE ATTAINMENT FOR BLACK ADULTS BY STATE

Gains in Degree Attainment for Black Adults Have Not Closed Gaps
Figure 5: Percentage Point Gains in Degree Attainment for Black Adults Since 2000 by State

*Change in degree attainment rate not statistically significant from zero based on an independent sample t-test at the 95 percent level of significance

**Figure 6**

Percentage point gap in black and white degree attainment for adults by state.

State Attainment Rate and Attainment Gaps Among Black Adults

Higher Black attainment rate and lower Black-White gap

Higher Black attainment rate and higher Black-White gap

Fewer than 15,000 Black adults

Lower Black attainment rate and lower Black-White gap

Lower Black attainment rate and higher Black-White gap

23% of Latino Adults and 47% of White Adults Have a College Degree or Higher

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau’s 2016 American Community Survey.
Attainment Gaps are Largest Among Young Latino and White Adults

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau’s 2016 American Community Survey.
Attainment in Several States Account for Much of the National Attainment Gap

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau’s 2016 American Community Survey.
Gains in Degree Attainment for Latino Adults Have Not Been Enough to Close Persistent Gaps

**Figure 2**: Percentage Point Gains in Degree Attainment for Latino and White Adults Since 2000

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau’s 2016 American Community Survey and the 2000 Decennial Census.
PERCENTAGE POINT GAINS IN DEGREE ATTAINMENT FOR LATINO ADULTS SINCE 2000 BY STATE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Percentage Gain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Louisiana</td>
<td>-1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tennessee</td>
<td>-0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Carolina</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alabama</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alaska</td>
<td>-0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mississippi</td>
<td>-0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missouri</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idaho</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arkansas</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delaware</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nebraska</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utah</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missouri</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minnesota</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Carolina</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virginia</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iowa</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nevada</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kansas</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arizona</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Mexico</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nevada</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colorado</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhode Island</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wyoming</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Change in degree attainment rate not statistically significant from zero based on an independent sample t-test at the 95 percent level of significance.

FIGURE 7
PERCENTAGE POINT GAP IN LATINO AND WHITE DEGREE ATTAINMENT FOR ADULTS BY STATE

Immigration Influences Latino Degree Attainment

**Figure 9** Degree Attainment for Latino Adults by Birthplace, 2016

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau’s 2016 American Community Survey.
Latino Degree Attainment Varies by Ethnic Group

Source: Ed Trust analysis of the United States Census Bureau’s 2016 American Community Survey.
State Attainment Rate and Attainment Gap Among Latino Adults

Higher Latino attainment rate and higher Latino-White gap

Lower Latino attainment rate and higher Latino-White gap

Higher Latino attainment rate and lower Latino-White gap

Fewer than 15,000 Latino adults

Lower Latino attainment rate and lower Latino-White gap

Racial Equity Analysis of State Attainment Goals
State Attainment Goals – National Context

Obama – 60% of 25-34 year olds with associate’s or above by 2020

Lumina – 60% of 25-64 year olds with a high quality certificate or above by 2025

As of 2016, 41.8% of adults held an associate’s or higher– 47% of White adults, 31% of Black adults and 23% of Latino adults

ETS Projections

| US will meet the Obama goal in 2041 | US will meet the Lumina goal in 2056. | Black and Latino populations will not have met either goal by 2060 (last year projected) |
Why Goals Matter

Setting Goals Can:

Inspire

Impact priorities

Encourage strategic decision making

Formalize the good intentions of individual actors
Race & Attainment Goals – The Opportunity

Gaps persist despite attainment gains

White adults outpaced Black and Latino adults in BA attainment growth since 2000

Some states with the largest percentages of people of color have no goals or have goals that don’t address racial equity

In some states, the lack of focus on race in attainment goals correlates with the actual attainment rates of Black and Latino adults
Income is Not a Proxy for Race

- Black students are much less likely to graduate from high school and attend college than white students with the same family income.

- Black bachelor’s degree completers are more likely to default (21%) than white college dropouts (18%).

- Black men raised in families in the top 1% of incomes are as likely to be incarcerated as white men raised in families earning $36,000.

- 51% of Black Americans born in the bottom income quintile stay there, and only 3% reach the top. 23% of poor White Americans stay in the bottom while 16% reach the top quintile.

Systemic Racial Inequity
Income is **Not** a Proxy for Race

Exhibit 5.1: Percentage bachelor’s degree attainment of students within six years of postsecondary enrollment, by race and ethnicity and family income quartile: From 2003–04 through 2008–09

Exhibit 5.2: Total annual salary of bachelor’s degree recipients four years after graduation, by race and ethnicity and family income: 2012
State Attainment Goals – Racial Equity Ratings Framework

In order to be considered in our analysis, the state’s materials related to the attainment goal had to be publicly available online, explicitly tied to the attainment goal, and issued by an entity responsible for developing or pursuing the goal.

1. Does the state have a degree attainment goal? (43/50)

2. Do the materials related to the goal mention race? (37/43)

3. Do they include data on gaps in enrollment, persistence, completion or attainment by race? (29/37)

4. Do they include a goal to improve outcomes for students of color and/or close racial equity gaps? (30/37)

5. Is the state’s goal to improve outcomes for students of color or close racial equity gaps supported by additional numerical targets, goals, benchmarks, and/or data analysis? (18/30)

6. Do the attainment goal materials identify strategies the state has used, is using, or will use to improve outcomes for students of color or close racial equity gaps? (25/37)
## State Attainment Goals – Best Practices

- **Set specific, separate attainment goals for racial subgroups**
- **Use current attainment levels of the relevant subgroups as a baseline**
- **Aim to increase the rates of attainment among underrepresented groups more rapidly than the overall population.**
- **Establish interim benchmarks for subgroups, track progress over time, and hold institutions, educators, and policymakers accountable**
- **Identify and pursue strategies aimed specifically at closing racial attainment gaps**
Minnesota Sets Specific Racial Equity Goals

Increase Needed of Minnesotans Age 25-44 with Postsecondary Certificates or Degrees to Attain 70% Goal by 2025, Basic Race/Ethnicity Groups, 2011-2015

Source: IPUMS microdata version of U.S. Census Bureau 2011-2015 American Community Survey, with tabulations and additional analysis by the Minnesota Demographic Center.
Texas Sets Interim Benchmarks for Racial Equity Goals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goal and Interim Benchmarks</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2025</th>
<th>2030</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increase the number of students completing a certificate, associate, bachelor’s, or master’s from an institution of higher education in Texas to at least...</td>
<td>376,000</td>
<td>455,000</td>
<td>550,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first four targets are directly related to the completion goal. To reach this goal, Texas will need to maintain the strong degree production increases that it has experienced in recent years. (298,989 as of 2014)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Targets to Reach the Goal</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2025</th>
<th>2030</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increase the number of Hispanic students completing a certificate or degree to at least...</td>
<td>138,000</td>
<td>198,000</td>
<td>285,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This target and the next one will help increase parity across completers for groups that have traditionally been underrepresented. (Hispanics 89,355 as of 2014; African Americans 37,658 as of 2014)

| Increase the number of African American students completing a certificate or degree to at least... | 48,000 | 59,000 | 76,000 |

| Increase the number of male students completing a certificate or degree to at least... | 168,000 | 215,000 | 275,000 |

The percentage of women enrolled in and graduating from higher education institutions has grown and men are not keeping pace. This target provides a means to monitor progress toward gender parity. (122,744 as of 2014)
Colorado Tracks Equity Completions Over Time

http://masterplan.highered.colorado.gov/dashboard/
Indiana Tracks Completion Gaps Over Time with Progress Indicators and...
Provides Campus-Level Completion Gap Data

INDIANA UNIVERSITY BLOOMINGTON

% of students who are

% Earning 30+ Credits

- financial aid reform
  - all students: 42%
  - 32%, 35%, 37%, 36%

% Persisting to Second Year

- all students: 93%
  - 92%, 90%, 88%, 92%

Closing the Achievement Gap: On-Time, Same Campus and Degree Level

Hover for Help
- Select Institution: IU Bloomington
- Select Completion Timeframe: On-Time, Same Campus and Degree Level

The achievement gap scale measures low-income and minority students’ success rates in relation to their peers. The gap is considered “closed” when the degree completion rates of the two student groups of interest are equal.

Minority Group: Black Students

Select Race/Ethnic Group: Black Students

% of Student Cohort: 5% (average of all years on chart)

The 309 Black Students who started at IU Bloomington in Fall 2013 were 0.62 times as likely a White students to complete On-Time, Same Campus and Degree Level.

Complete On Time (same campus & degree level)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Minorities (Black or Hispanic)</th>
<th>Complete</th>
<th>1 Yr</th>
<th>5 Yr</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minority</td>
<td>50.5%</td>
<td>+0.2</td>
<td>+8.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Complete Within 6 Years (any campus or degree level)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Complete</th>
<th>1 Yr</th>
<th>5 Yr</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All Students</td>
<td>66.7%</td>
<td>+2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>72.8%</td>
<td>+1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>83.8%</td>
<td>+1.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

https://www.in.gov/che/3032.htm
Oregon Provides Enrollment, Affordability, and Outcomes Data by Race for Each Institution
# Numerous States Identify Race-Conscious Strategies for Closing Gaps

## Target Students and Faculty of Color

- **KY**: Academic Leadership Development Institute for early career faculty of color
- **MN**: Equity in Education and Job Connection Grants
- **MO**: efforts to recruit and retain diverse faculty
- **OK**: outreach to immigrant students, connection to ESL services
- **TX**: supporting grants for Minority Male Initiatives

## Prioritize Equity in Planning and Policy Development

- **KY**: statewide diversity policy, campus diversity plans w/ targets on select goals and annual progress tracking
- **MN**: OHE Equity Institute
- **NV**: Diversity Summits; Chancellor’s Diversity Roundtable; Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Council
- **OR**: Equity Lens

## Target Institutions Serving Students of Color

- **MD**: Support HBCUs, Foster Collaboration Between HBCUs and PWIs
- **NV**: HSI Task Force
The How - Strategies for Embedding Equity in State Attainment Goals & Postsecondary Plans

From the USC Center for Urban Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Know your state.</th>
<th>• Conduct a rigorous analysis of economic and demographic contexts.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Create goals.</td>
<td>• Create attainment goals that are clear, ambitious, and reflect equity priorities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Build a careful process.</td>
<td>• Start the equity conversation by establishing a deliberate, inclusive process of plan development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Craft a strong message.</td>
<td>• Develop a clear “story” about the equity imperative in your state.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know what works.</td>
<td>• Identify policy assets and levers that can reinforce equity-focused attainment goals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make the plan a living document.</td>
<td>• Monitor and report publicly on progress and update goals regularly.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thank You!

J. Oliver Schak  
Senior Research Analyst for Higher Education Research  
OSchak@edtrust.org // @SchakJ

Wil Del Pilar  
Vice President for Higher Education Policy and Practice  
WDelPilar@edtrust.org // @Wil_EdTrust